



**COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
43500 MONTEREY AVE
PALM DESERT, CA 92260
FRIDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2014
9:30 am**

I. CALL TO ORDER - Chair Broughton called the meeting to order at 9:33 am and asked Dr. Bill Kroonen to lead the pledge of allegiance.

Dr. Kinnamon – Dr. Kinnamon conducted the roll call:
Trustee Broughton
Trustee O’Neill
Trustee Stefan
Trustee Sanchez
Trustee Wilson
Student Trustee Campbell (arrival 10:30 am)

Parliamentarian – Carlos Maldonado
Recorder – Angela Walton

II. SWEARING IN OF TRUSTEES:

Trustee Becky Broughton – sworn in by Dr. Joel Kinnamon

Trustee Aurora Wilson – sworn in by the Honorable Lupe Ramos Wilson

Trustee O’Neill requested a point of order, stating that there were significant conflicting statements in Board Policy 2210, “Officers of the Board”, specifically statements regarding elections and rotating officers. Trustee O’Neill requested that the Board begin the process of reviewing this policy in January 2015. Parliamentarian Carlos Maldonado stated that Trustee Broughton, as ruling as chair, had the option of using past precedence to follow the rotation as stated in the policy, or take a vote (2/3 majority) to suspend this appointment process until January 2015. Trustee Broughton stated that she preferred to vote. Trustee Wilson stated she preferred the rotation precedence. Trustee O’Neill stated he would prefer the rotation, but requests a full review of the policy. Trustee Sanchez-Fulton stated she prefers the rotation, and Trustee Stefan stated she also prefers rotating, with a full review of this policy in January 2015.

Hearing no objections, Trustee Broughton stated the Board will continue with the rotation process and review the policy and process in January.

III. ORGANIZATION FOR 2015: Appointment of Officers

1. Chairperson – Dr. Bonnie Stefan

Trustee Broughton passed the gavel to the new Chairperson, Trustee Stefan. Trustee Stefan offered comments on Trustee Broughton, stating that she has brought a new level of excellence to the office of Chair of the Board of Trustees. Trustee Stefan praised Trustee Broughton's dedication to the college, thanked her for her service and presented Trustee Broughton with a plaque.

2. Vice Chairperson – Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton

3. Clerk – Aurora Wilson

4. Secretary – Dr. Joel Kinnamon

5. Representative/COD Foundation Board of Directors – Becky Broughton

6. Representative/County Committee – Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton

7. Liaison to Auxiliary Boards – Michael O'Neill. Trustee Broughton addressed this appointment, stating that this will provide an opportunity for the Trustee to develop relationships with these Boards, and that this will be a position that will grow.

8. Representative/Citizen's Bond Oversight Committee – Aurora Wilson

9. Parliamentarian – Carlos Maldonado. Trustee O'Neill thanked Mr. Maldonado for being an outstanding parliamentarian and for continuing in this role.

Trustee Stefan requested written reports from staff who provide monthly reports to the Board of Trustees, and reported that there will be other things that she will request the Board members to do also.

IV. CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

Confirmation of Agenda – Approve the agenda of the regular meeting of December 19, 2014, with additions, corrections, or deletions.

There were no additions or changes to the agenda. The agenda stands approved as presented.

V. CLOSED SESSION

1. CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATOR, Pursuant to Section 54957.6; unrepresented groups & labor unions on campus include CTA, CODAA, and CSEA Agency Designated Representative: Dr. Joel L. Kinnamon
2. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL ANTICIPATED LITIGATION: Section 54956.9 (d)(2/3/4) Specify number of potential cases: 6
3. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATORS: Property: Parcel Numbers: 669 330 047, 611 211 002, 611 211 008, 611 211 009, 611 211 010,

611 211 015, 717 270 016, 717 270 017, 717 270 020, 717 270 227, 502 190 003, 502 190 004, 502 190 008, 502 190 015, 502 190 019, 502 190 020

VI. OPEN SESSION

Closed Session report – Trustee Stefan stated that no reportable action was taken in closed session.

VII. PUBLIC COMMENTS

1. Carolyn and Tom Swan – Veterans for Peace – Ms. Swan described the purpose of their not-for-profit organization. She described Trustee Sanchez-Fulton’s efforts in their community, and provided her with an award: “Vets for Peace, 2014 Elected Official of the Year. We honor your leadership and devoted service to our students and veterans. Also your tireless efforts to advance equality, peace, and social justice.”
2. Michael McJilton - Faculty – provided a written proclamation from the Department of Mathematics and Computer Science, and read the statement to the Board of Trustees. The Department of Mathematics recommended that the Board of Trustees “keep the Senate-approved changes to the curriculum of the courses MATH 1A, 1B, 2A, 2B, and 2C on the consent agenda with all of the other curriculum changes that were approved by the Curriculum Committee and the Academic Senate.”
3. Geoff Hagopian - Faculty – distributed a statement on behalf of the math department.

VIII. BOND FINANCING UPDATE – Lisa Howell, VP Administrative Services, introduced Adam Bauer, who she announced would be presenting an opportunity for a refunding which may save taxpayers money. Mr. Bauer of Fieldman, Rolapp & Associates provided a presentation: “Refunding of the 2005 General Obligation Refunding Bonds and Review of Existing Debt.” Mr. Bauer highlights included:

- The college’s credit worthiness is extremely strong
- Historical total assessed value of the college is a 4.85 - 10-year average
- The District has 4 series of GO Bonds outstanding under the 2004 Prop 39 Election – not-to-exceed authorization of \$346.5 million
- The 2005 GO Refunding Bonds are callable on a current refunding basis on August 1, 2015 – 87.5% of proceeds were used to advance refund the Series 2004A Bonds, 12.5% of proceeds were used towards new projects and infrastructure
- The District can current refund the 2005 GO Refunding Bonds using historically low tax-exempt interest rates
- Refunding in May of 2015 would result in an approximate 15.16% savings, estimated \$6.64 million in NPV savings, average annual savings of approximately \$800,000
- Refunding decision would require Board approval in early 2015
- Refunding would assist with continued growth of COD

- Mr. Bauer discussed bonding capacity (maximum of 2.50% of assessed value) and tax rate limitations (maximum of \$25 per \$100,000 per voter authorized GO Bond Program)
- Requires voter approval of 55% full district approval
- At least 88 days before election, projects to be financed must be stated, tax rate estimated and bond amount named, and Board must declare resolution for election
- After election – citizens oversight committee appointed and annual audits required
- List allowable use of proceeds – construction, reconstruction, rehabilitation or replacement of school facilities, including the furnishing and equipping of school facilities, or the acquisition or lease of real property for school facilities
- Mr. Bauer described how tax rate is determined
- A successful GO Bond election held in June or November 2016 would allow the District to issue new money by early 2017 an issue approximately \$712 million within 8 years
- A successful GO Bond election held in June or November 2016 would allow the District to fund \$250 million for projects by early 2017 using only a tax rate of \$13.70 per \$100,000 of assessed value
- Parcel Tax Analysis – described how this would work; parcel tax could be used for any type of authorized spending or operating expense that general fund moneys can be spent on
- Parcel tax election could be a special election, but COD would be required to pay for the election
- Structure of parcel tax – would need a 2/3rds voter approval
- A \$100 parcel tax levy would generate approximately \$23.4 million in tax revenues per year
- A \$50 parcel tax analysis would generate approximately \$23.4 million in tax revenues per year
- A separate independent firm would conduct the survey and could cost approximately \$25,000 - \$30,000 in college funds to conduct the survey
- Alternate scenario - \$84 million in unspent bond proceeds from its 2007 Series C bond issue – pays a penalty of \$4.295 million each year due to balance of unspent proceeds

Trustee Broughton stated that we owe it to the community to communicate clearly as to what will be built with money that the college receives. These goals need to be documented in such a way that future Board of Trustee members and COD staff are informed as to what promises and goals we have undertaken. This will help all parties stay focused yet still allow for modifications that will enhance student success.

Mr. Bauer recommended doing a survey of the community before making decisions on how to proceed.

IX. INTRODUCTION OF NEW FULL-TIME STAFF

There were no new employees to introduce this month.

X. MINUTES

Trustee Stefan stated there were no corrections that the minutes of the November 20, 2014 minutes, and they stand approved.

Trustee Broughton clarified that the minutes are always provided to the Board and staff members prior to Board meetings for review and corrections.

X. REPORTS

- A. ASCOD – John Zepeda, ASCOD President, was present and gave a brief report.
- B. College of the Desert Foundation – Jan Hawkins and Peter Sturgeon were present and provided brief reports.
- C. The Street Fair – Amber Fleming was present and gave a brief report.
- D. Academic Senate – Douglas Redmond was present and gave a brief report.
- E. CODFA – Denise Diamond was present and gave a brief report.
- F. CODAA – David Bashore was present and gave a brief report.
- G. CSEA – Lauro Jimenez was present and gave a brief report.

XI. CLOSED SESSION (Cont'd)

4. PERSONNEL

- a. **HUMAN RESOURCES** – Leadership Contracts
- b. **PUBLIC EMPLOYEE APPOINTMENT**
(Government Code Section 54957)
Title: 1. Director of Financial Aid
 2. Executive Director of Educational Technology
- c. **PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:**
 - Superintendent/President

Closed session report:

Motion: In closed session, a motion was made by Trustee Wilson and seconded by Trustee Sanchez-Fulton to appoint Deanna Murrell as Director of Financial Aid, effective January 12, 2015.

Discussion: None.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Motion: In closed session, a motion was made by Trustee Broughton and seconded by Trustee Wilson to authorize enter into an employment agreement extending Ms. Sheri Willis as Director of Information Technology effective January 12, 2015 through June 30, 2017.

Discussion: None.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion: In closed session, a motion was made by Trustee Broughton and seconded by Trustee Wilson to authorize President Kinnamon to enter into three leadership employment agreements, all in favor.

Discussion: None.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

H. Governing Board

Trustee O’Neill – Trustee O’Neill reported that he attended the recent Citizens of Distinction event and stated that having students, faculty and deans at the event was important. Trustee O’Neill also attended the Foundation’s President’s Circle event which was a reception and tour of three new campus buildings. He thanked the deans, faculty, staff and students who participated to make the event a success. He thanked Bert Bitanga for the impressive display done with the 3D printer for the event. Trustee O’Neill reported that all Board members attended the Foundation Board meeting this month, and that this was his last meeting as the Board representative to the Foundation.

He thanked Donna Jean Darby of the Foundation Board for her work in working with the college, and thanked the Foundation for their hard work. Trustee O'Neill reported he attended the Health and Welfare Committee meeting, as well as the CCLC conference. He shared information learned during various sessions at the CCLC conference including a session regarding a planning grant for adult basic skills which is due to go to the legislature in March, and hopes COD will be able to provide feedback with what is going on locally. Trustee O'Neill also attended the California College Board of Governors reception and tour at the Annenberg Foundation Trust at Sunnylands where he had the opportunity to meet former chancellors. He discovered that COD has a substantial relationship with Sunnylands and has met Michaelleen Gallagher, Director of Education and Environmental Programs, Sunnylands Center and Gardens, who will be attending the February 11 Board of Trustees meeting to discuss working jointly with COD in expanding our programs and doing joint work with their Foundation.

Trustee O'Neill stated that intimidation, threats, and bullying cannot be tolerated at COD. He reported that he will do everything he can to prevent instances like this from occurring, and that in the future, as a representative of the college, he will be making this his focus.

Trustee Wilson – Trustee Wilson stated that 2014 has been a year of change for her. She continues to serve as a Board trustee and is meeting students, learning the community college system, and after the tough campaign and winning election, she made the decision to retire from CVAG and her last day is Dec. 30. Trustee Wilson offered sincere apologies for not being able to attend many events in November and December. She attended Friends of Library event and Academic Angels event, and congratulated the citizens for the event. Trustee Wilson also attended the holiday party for John Benoit, the Foundation Board meeting, as well as the Locolandia event at the Marks Art Gallery and the Worlds Affairs Council. She was also able to attend the nursing pinning ceremony and the basic peace officers graduation. Trustee Wilson stated she looks forward to the next four years.

Trustee Broughton – thanked the Board for all of their support over the past year, and it has been an honor to be Chair. COD was represented at the PSA Blue Light ceremony to remember fallen officers, which she attended. She thanked the Foundation for letting the Board of Trustees to be guests at their recent Board meeting. Trustee Broughton stated the two Boards have a better understanding of each other, and the meeting was beneficial to both groups. Trustee Broughton stated the Trustees have been involved in the special Board meetings recently. She asked Anna Davies, Executive Vice President, Student Success/Student Learning and her staff to continue to reach out to the East Valley about classes needed and jobs needed to help those students succeed. Trustee Broughton stated she looks forward to the new year, and congratulated to Bonnie Stefan on becoming the Board Chair.

Trustee Sanchez–Fulton – Trustee Sanchez–Fulton stated she is excited to be a community representative, and that she also attended the recent CCLC conference. She commended COD for their work during the conference as COD was one of the hosts, and commended the students’ performances. Trustee Sanchez-Fulton also attended the nurse pinning ceremony, the CSEA luncheon, as well as the Desert Hot Springs holiday parade, and thanked the COD staff that for providing banners and outreach materials. Trustee Sanchez–Fulton also attended the Indio festival and thanked the students who participated in that event. Trustee Sanchez–Fulton attended the Desert Hot Springs city council meeting and the St. Elizabeth Holiday Boutique, and thanked COD for the winter intersession, which will help transfer rates at COD.

Trustee Stefan – congratulated Trustee Wilson and Trustee Broughton on winning the elections. Trustee Stefan conveyed stories of students she met in the community. One of the students stated to her that he was happy there was a winter intersession coming up where he could take the math class he needed for his program. Trustee Stefan stated she attended the jazz band concert, and met one of the student singers in the concert, who is transferring to UC Berkley from COD. Trustee Stefan stated there was another current COD student who is a former student of hers who chose to attend COD at Trustee Stefan’s urging. Trustee Stefan reported she attended the Public Safety Academy graduation, met another student who graduated and other students who graduated from Module 3. Trustee Stefan stated she wanted to relate these stories to the Board and staff as these were her gifts, and wished everyone happy holidays.

Student Trustee Campbell – Student Trustee Campbell reported that she attended the Foundation Board meeting, and was happy to meet people who do good things for our community. She attended the Region 9 meeting at COD, and other colleges visited. Student Trustee Campbell also attended the nursing pinning ceremony, and plans on attending the ASCOD winter retreat in January. Student Trustee Campbell reported she visited the PACE office in Palm Desert, and is happy that COD is a part of that organization. Student Trustee Campbell reported she attended the Citizens of Distinction lunch, and thanked the governing Board, ASCOD and Carlos Maldonado for their support. She also attended the Annenberg tour, and thanked Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton for inviting her to attend the CCLC conference.

Superintendent/President – Dr. Kinnamon congratulated Dr. Stefan, and acknowledged Trustee Broughton on her term as Board Chair and thanked her for her patience and leadership over the past year. Dr. Kinnamon reported that a FLEX dinner is being planned for January 22. Dr. Kinnamon commended Donna Jean Darby and the Foundation staff for doing a remarkable job with fundraising, and expressed his appreciation for all they have done over the past year by providing resources that will directly impact

students. Dr. Kinnamon stated they have been looking at challenges the students have faced getting classes for transfer and moving forward even with 30 units or more, and is pleased that COD has been able to expand the class offerings and implement the winter intersession. Dr. Kinnamon reported the faculty, Academic Senate and College Planning Council have been engaged in the process of faculty prioritization, and they will continue to assess and improve the process, and COD will be recruiting additional faculty soon. Dr. Kinnamon expressed his appreciation to faculty and staff for engaging in the process.

Trustee O'Neill stated that recently at a restaurant, he met a young man who is attending COD but could not get all the classes he needed, but now has math class at intersession and a full schedule in the spring, and was very pleased at being able to get the classes he needed. Trustee O'Neill reported that this intersession has made an immediate impact on the community and students. EVP Anna Davies reported that everyone has played an important role in winter intersession, and that of the 62 classes, 20 sections still have seats available, and there will be added classes in core areas on both sides of district and on main campus in the spring. There have been no reported crashes with registration, and the students are expressing their gratitude.

XII. CONSENT AGENDA:

A. Human Resources

1. ~~Employment Group C Appointments~~ *Pulled for discussion*
2. Employment Group A Appointments
3. Working Out of Class
4. Extension of Assignment
5. Resignation/Retirement
6. Approval of Agreement between the Desert Community College District (DCCD) and the College of the Desert Adjunct Association
7. Early Retirement Incentive Program
8. Approval of Vice President Human Resources & Labor Relations Job Description

B. Administrative Services

1. ~~Purchase Orders and Contracts for Supplies, Services and Construction~~ *Pulled for discussion*
2. Warrants
3. Approval of Contracts/Agreements and Amendments
4. Payroll
5. Gifts/Donation to the District
6. Amendments to Contracts – Measure B Bond Projects
7. Change Orders – Measure B Bond Projects
8. Notice of Completion – Measure B Bond Projects
9. ~~Budget Transfers~~ *Pulled for discussion*

C. Student Success/Student Learning

1. ~~Approval of Curriculum Modifications for Fall 2015~~ *Pulled for discussion*

Trustee Wilson pulled Student Success/Student Learning Item C-1, Approval of Curriculum modifications, for discussion. Trustee O'Neill pulled Human Resources Item A-1, Employment Group C Appointments, and Administrative Services Item B-1, Supplies, Services and Construction, for discussion. Trustee Broughton pulled Administrative Services Item B9, Budget Transfers. Trustee O'Neill thanked donors on their gifting items to COD (Administrative Services Item 5).

Motion: Motion by Trustee Broughton, seconded by Trustee O'Neill to approve the consent agenda as amended.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The consent agenda stands approved as amended.

Action Agenda:

A. Items Pulled from Consent Agenda for Separate Discussion and Consideration.

Human Resources Item A-1, Employment Group C Appointments

Motion: Motion made by Trustee Wilson, seconded by Student Trustee Campbell, to approve this item.

Discussion – Trustee O'Neill inquired about increased counseling for new student orientation, and staff reported it could be attributable to winter intersession.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved as presented.

Administrative Services Item B-1, Supplies, Services and Construction

Motion: Motion made by Trustee O'Neill, seconded by Trustee Broughton, to approve this item.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Discussion – Trustee O’Neill questioned the removal of descriptive information on purchase orders, stating that it will make it difficult for the Board of Trustees to know what they are authorizing if the information is absent. President Kinnamon stated there has been a great deal of discussion with staff regarding the proper descriptors on the purchase order report, and that it is COD’s intent is to work with the county to determine a better reporting process. Lisa Howell, Vice President of Administrative Services, explained that some employees included improper descriptive information, and once the information has been redacted from the report, it cannot be changed. Ms. Howell stated she has requested a new report format from Riverside County, and will keep the Board updated on the progress.

Ms. Howell updated the Board members on improvements to the enhanced My COD web portal, reporting that unlike other years, there were no crashes in the system to date. Ms. Howell also stated that they continue to work on cameras at Mecca/Thermal, that the installation is going well, and once Phase 1 is complete, Lt. Misti Reynolds will evaluate the system before moving on to Phase 2.

Trustee Stefan questioned the purchase of a Fiat that was found on the report. Ms. Howell reported that the car has been purchased for use in the automotive technology program.

Dr. Kinnamon stated that in the recent facilities update presentation that was provided to the Board of Trustees, the administration office was not included in the original facilities presentation, but that the office is currently being updated, and the plans for moving Human Resources and Fiscal Services into the administration building will begin in the near future. The expectation is that relocating Human Resources and Fiscal Services will make the portables where these services are currently housed available by the Fall. Trustee O’Neill asked for the diagrams to be updated and shared with the Board. Ms. Davies added that the faculty adjunct offices will be moved out of Hilb.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved as presented

Administrative Services Item B9 - Budget Transfers

Motion: Motion made by Trustee Broughton, seconded by Trustee O’Neill, to approve this item.

Discussion – Trustee Broughton inquired about the resolution from last board meeting regarding budget transfers. Ms. Howell stated that this is the normal changing of funds, and the report will be available at the next Board meeting along with a resolution requesting Board approval.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Student Success/Student Learning Item CI - Curriculum Modification

Motion: Motion made by Trustee Wilson, seconded by Trustee Broughton, to approve this item.

Discussion – The Board of Trustees requested discussion from staff for open discussion on the curriculum modification. President Kinnamon addressed this issue stating that the student, faculty and Academic Senate perspectives have been heard, and staff is currently trying to determine if there is data that indicates that this change will not be successful. Dr. Annabelle Nery addressed Math Course Items 54-58 on the curriculum listing, reporting that her office did pull data on courses that had a common shift to include lab hours, and that the information was made available to the Academic Senate and ASCOD representatives.

Motion: Trustee O’Neill stated that this appears to be a significant issue, and that he would like to make a motion to remove Items 54-58 from the curriculum listing to be revisited at the January meeting when staff can return with more information to properly address this matter.

Dr. Kinnamon asked Dr. Nery if a January Board approval would give an unintended consequence, to which she responded that there would be consequences. Dr. Nery explained the issues surrounding this matter, discussed the consequences of waiting until January to approve the curriculum, and the problems that might be caused by submitting the curriculum data to the Chancellor’s office after the deadline. She reported she has some initial data regarding this issue; the courses approved were part of a transfer degree of which the deadline was this month for submittal to the Chancellor’s office. Dr. Nery reported that there is a small student population in this major. An initial study was

conducted, and it was found that changing a lecture hour to a lab hour in essence increases student classroom hours. Dr. Nery described the type of research that was performed on this matter. Trustee O'Neill asked what the outcome would be if this section is not approved in January. Dr. Nery stated if the curriculum is not approved, math does not complete the Math TMD.

Motion: Trustee O'Neill amended this motion to remove Items 54-58 from the Curriculum listing and bring them back for discussion at the January Board meeting.

Carlos Maldonado, Parliamentarian, stated that the motion must be one to divide and pull Items 54-58 to stand alone as a separate item.

Motion to divide:

Trustee O'Neill has rescinded earlier motion, and made the new motion to divide Items 54-58 from the Curriculum listing and have them be a separate item. Student Trustee Campbell seconded the motion.

Discussion - none

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved as presented.

Student Success/Student Learning Item CI - Curriculum Modification

Trustee O'Neill made the motion to approve the remainder of the Curriculum Modifications, Items 1-53, and Items 59-67, as well as the balance of the curriculum listing. Student Trustee Campbell seconded the motion.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

XIII. ACTION ITEMS

Motion to postpone:

Motion: Trustee O’Neill made the motion to bring Items 54 – 58 (MATH-001A, MATH-001B, MATH-002A, MATH-002B, MATH-002C) on the Curriculum Modifications for Fall 2015 back to the January Board of Trustees meeting for the purpose of receiving information from staff addressing the concerns that were raised by the Board of Trustees, faculty and by public comments. Student Trustee Campbell seconded the motion.

Discussion: Trustee O’Neill also requested information from Dr. Nery’s data as how successful this type of change has been at other schools, data on other courses of a similar nature that have been attempted at COD and their success rates, the amount of seat time this is requiring, and that if this measure is approved, confirmation that it falls inside of the Chancellor’s guidelines for curriculum. Trustee Broughton stated the students should have an opportunity to write down their concerns and submit them to the President’s office. Trustee O’Neill also asked that it be determined if this would cause an impediment to student progress per Title 5, and that an interpretation is provided to the Board of Trustees to decide if this is a consideration for making a determination in this matter. Trustee Stefan asked staff to also investigate increases in seat time for this area and how it will impact the students being able to secure other classes they will need at the same time to complete their programs.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Administrative Services

1. Public Hearing Regarding Energy Conservation Contract

Motion: Trustee Sanchez-Fulton made the motion to approve the Public Hearing Regarding Energy Conservation Contract, Trustee O’Neill seconded.

Discussion – none

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

Trustee Stefan opened the Public Hearing - no comments were received. Trustee Stefan closed the Public hearing.

2. Resolution 121914-1 Energy Conservation Project and Authorization to Enter Energy Services Agreement with Jackson Electric

Motion: Motion made by Trustee Wilson, seconded by Trustee O’Neill to adopt Resolution 121914-1, Energy Conservation with Jackson Electric.

Discussion – Trustee O’Neill inquired if the same types of bulbs were being changed out repeatedly. Lisa Howell stated they are not the same bulbs, and that this is a Prop 39 Year 2 project, and this phase includes putting controllers on panels in the parking structures that will have dimmers and timers. The cost for retrofitting existing parking lighting with controllable LED fixtures, and additional work for safety measure exceeds the amount of money gained from Prop 39, which was approved for \$279,357; the combined project total is \$355,300, and the difference will be paid from redevelopment funds. Trustee O’Neill asked about environmental impact if changing to LED lighting in the walkways, and Ms. Howell stated she would find the answer to his question, but was not sure if the safety lighting was LED lighting. Trustee Stefan asked if the lights will have motion detection, and Ms. Howell stated that they will be on timers, not motion detection.

Roll Call Vote – Dr. Kinnamon conducted the roll call vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell
No: None
Absent: None
Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

3. Certification of Signatures

Motion: Motion made by Trustee Sanchez-Fulton, seconded by Trustee Campbell approve the Certification of Signatures as presented.

Discussion – Trustee O’Neill asked if the form was prepared to be signed

Vote:
Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell
No: None
Absent: None
Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

4. 2013-2014 Audit Reports

Motion: Motion made by Trustee O’Neill, seconded by Trustee Sanchez-Fulton to approve the 2013-2014 Audit Reports as presented.

Discussion – Heidi White, CPA, Vavrinek, Trine, Day & Co., LLP, and John Ramont, Director of Fiscal Services presented the audit. Highlights:

- A prior period adjustment was made due to a change in accounting principles
- Ms. White urged the Board to review management letter
- District provided over \$24 million in financial aid to students, compliance was tested in this area and no areas of non-compliance were found
- District received and extended over \$20 million in federal programs, including programs other than student financial aid, and no areas of non-compliance were found
- CCFS-311 – indicated that there were no audit adjustments needed
- Summary of opinions – In financial statements, no material weaknesses, no significant deficiencies, and no areas of noncompliance. In federal awards, no material weaknesses, no significant deficiencies found and unmodified opinion.
- General obligation bonds – provided separate report on bonds and compliance reports, which yielded unmodified opinions, no adjustments, and no areas of noncompliance.

Discussion – Trustee Wilson commented that the audit was very thorough and very well done. Trustee O’Neill commented that the bond project has been exceptionally well managed; Ms. Howell reported the Bond committee meets quarterly.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

5. Receive Actuarial Study

Motion: Motion made by Trustee Sanchez-Fulton, seconded by Trustee O’Neill to approve/receive the Actuarial Study as presented.

Discussion - John Ramont provided a presentation on the actuarial study, stating that the information provided in the report dates back to April 1, 2014, which was the valuation date. Mr. Ramont provided an overview of the retiree program offered by the District; if an employee has been with the District for fifteen years and they retire after age 55, the District will pay their health insurance until the employee is Medicare-eligible at age 65, and will get the same benefits as an active employee. Mr. Ramont explained that the District is responsible for accruing for this program, and that it is detailed in the actuarial

report, which is completed every two years. Ms. Howell provided further detail on how contributions are made for employees and retirees, and reported the District is already at full funding, so the District would not have to contribute this year. She stated that it was a concern that the money was not earning much interest and that there was another option for these funds. Trustee O’Neill reported that a presentation had been given by a company that could invest the funds into irrevocable trust and funds would not have to be contributed by the District unless the funding fell below its obligation. Trustee O’Neill stated that COD is unique in that it is one of the few organizations that funds retiree obligations. Ms. Howell stated she is working with the Health and Welfare Committee on researching other companies offering this option and the committee will make recommendations on how best to proceed.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

Student Success & Student Learning

1. Approval of 2014-15 College Catalog Addendum

Motion: Motion made by Student Trustee Campbell, seconded by Trustee O’Neill to approve the 2014-15 College Catalog Addendum as presented.

Discussion – none

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: None

Absent: None

Abstain: None

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

XIV. STUDY SESSION: Review of Student Success 2014 Scorecard – Dr. Daniel Martinez

2014 Scorecard – Based on Five Metrics

- Data sources – MIS (College Data), System-wide data, and data available to the CCC Chancellor’s Office
- Outcomes are based on cohorts, which are defined differently, but are followed for six years. 2014 Scorecard = 2007-2008

- Comparison groups are created by a mathematical statistical formula that looks at API score, BA index which uses census data and number of students who are 25 years of age or older

Momentum Points

1. Remedial progress

Trends:

- COD's average class size for credit courses is slightly higher than statewide size (28); and % of full-time faculty is below statewide average (56.9%). More females than males attend COD (similar to state average), most students (62%) are 24 years old or younger (similar to state average), and two of every three COD students are Hispanic, much higher than the state average (66% at COD vs. 38% statewide).
- ESL is the only discipline that has decreased in the past two years; however, ESL is the only discipline where COD is higher than the comparison group and the statewide average
- Females perform at higher % than males in Math, English, and ESL
- Students under 20 are most likely to complete college level English and Math – students 20-24 are most likely to complete college level ESL, with under 20 coming in a close second
- Asians are most likely to complete the college level course of the basic skills discipline into which they enrolled

2. Persistence

Trends:

- COD students persist at higher rates than the comparison group for all three categories
- Younger (under 20) and older (40+) students persist at higher rates than other age groups
- Asian students have the highest persistence rate of any other ethnic group

3. 30 units

Trends:

- COD students completed 30 units at lower rates than the comparison group and the statewide for all three categories
- College prepared White students completed 30 units at a higher percent than other Racial/Ethnic groups
- Unprepared for college Asian students completed 30 units at a higher percent than other Racial/Ethnic groups

Completion Outcomes

1. Degree transfer

Trends:

- COD students completed at lower rates than the comparison group and the statewide for all three categories
- Filipino students have a higher % of completion for all three categories
- Hispanic and White students have similar completion rates in all categories

- College prepares students have over a 25% higher completion rate compared to unprepared college students

2. Career Technical Education

Trends:

- COD CTE students completed at higher rates than the comparison group and the statewide for all three categories
- Women complete their CTE pathways at higher percent than their Male counterparts
- Under 20 population complete their CTE pathways at a higher percent than the other age categories
- Filipino & Asian students complete their CTE pathways at higher percent than other Ethnic/Racial counterparts

Trustee Sanchez-Fulton asked Dr. Martinez what percentages of COD faculty are Hispanic, to which Dr. Martinez responded that percentage would not be a part of this score card, but may be part of the Student Equity Report. Trustee O'Neill commented that overall, COD appears to be above the state average. Anna Davies commented that transfers degree/certificate completions at COD are slightly lower, and stated she would be interested in determining what barriers might exist for students.

Trustee Sanchez-Fulton inquired if there was any information on minority men. Dr. Martinez responded that the same data sets are used for the Student Equity Report, and the information can be found on that report. Trustee Stefan, asked how many students from 2005-2006 graduated earlier than six years. Dr. Martinez responded that anyone completing within that time frame is counted in the report.

Student Trustee Campbell asked if there was any data on student workers and success rates, stating that if there were more employment opportunities at COD, the success rate might be higher. Trustee Broughton stated that it would be interesting to trend how dual enrollment students do in college. Trustee Broughton also expressed her concern at how the ESL data could be misinterpreted on this report. The Board of Trustees thanked Dr. Martinez for his report.

Correction: Trustee Stefan made correction to the closed session report: Trustee Broughton made the motion, and Trustee Wilson seconded the motion authorizing Dr. Kinnamon to extend an offer to Ms. Sheri Willis, as Executive Director of Education Technology, effective January 12, 2015 through June 30, 2017.

XV. ADJOURN

There were no objections to adjourning the meeting. Meeting adjourned at 4:05.



By: Aurora Wilson, Clerk